Detroit
Michigan
Detroit
Michigan
Reviving Livernois Avenue as a Thriving Urban Main Street

January 18–21, 2011
A ULI Daniel Rose Fellowship Program City Study Visit Report

Urban Land Institute
Daniel Rose Center for Public Leadership in Land Use
1025 Thomas Jefferson Street, NW
Suite 500 West
Washington, DC 20007-5201
About the Urban Land Institute

The mission of the Urban Land Institute is to provide leadership in the responsible use of land and in creating and sustaining thriving communities worldwide. ULI is committed to

- Bringing together leaders from across the fields of real estate and land use policy to exchange best practices and serve community needs;
- Fostering collaboration within and beyond ULI’s membership through mentoring, dialogue, and problem solving;
- Exploring issues of urbanization, conservation, regeneration, land use, capital formation, and sustainable development;
- Advancing land use policies and design practices that respect the uniqueness of both built and natural environments;
- Sharing knowledge through education, applied research, publishing, and electronic media; and
- Sustaining a diverse global network of local practice and advisory efforts that address current and future challenges.

Established in 1936, the Institute today has nearly 30,000 members worldwide, representing the entire spectrum of the land use and development disciplines. Professionals represented include developers, builders, property owners, investors, architects, public officials, planners, real estate brokers, appraisers, attorneys, engineers, financiers, academics, students, and librarians.

ULI relies heavily on the experience of its members. It is through member involvement and information resources that ULI has been able to set standards of excellence in development practice. The Institute has long been recognized as one of the world’s most respected and widely quoted sources of objective information on urban planning, growth, and development.
The mission of the ULI Daniel Rose Center for Public Leadership in Land Use is to encourage and support excellence in land use decision making by providing public officials with access to information, best practices, peer networks, and other resources to foster creative, efficient, practical, and sustainable land use policies.

Daniel Rose, chairman of Rose Associates Inc., in New York City, in 2008 committed $5 million to the Urban Land Institute to create the center. Rose Associates operates throughout the East Coast as developer and manager of more than 30 million square feet of major office towers, commercial retail centers, mixed-use complexes, and high-rise residential buildings. Rose has pursued a career involving a broad range of professional, civic, and nonprofit activities.

The Daniel Rose Fellowship is the flagship program of the Rose Center. The Rose Fellowship is a yearlong program (from fall of the first year to fall of the next) intended to benefit the individual fellows through leadership training and professional development opportunities and to benefit their respective cities through technical assistance on a local land use challenge. The Rose Fellowship focuses on leadership, integrated problem solving, public/private collaboration, and peer-to-peer learning.

For the 2010–2011 fellowship year, the Rose Center invited the mayors of Charlotte, Detroit, Houston, and Sacramento to participate. Each mayor selected three additional fellows and a coordinator to serve as the Rose Fellowship team from his or her city. Each city’s Rose Fellowship team selected a specific land use challenge on which they receive technical assistance.

During the city study visits, two assigned Rose Center faculty members, one fellow from each of the other three cities, and additional experts spend four days visiting each of the fellowship cities to learn about their land use challenge. Modeled after ULI’s Advisory Services panels, these visits include briefings from the host city’s fellows and other local officials, a tour of the study area, and interviews with stakeholders. The visits conclude with a presentation of initial observations and recommendations from the visiting panel of experts, as well as ongoing assignments for the fellowship team. Each city’s fellowship team also works with its assigned faculty at the ULI Fall Meeting and at two working retreats, and Rose Center staff and faculty return later in the year to conduct a follow-up visit.

The Rose Center also holds forums and workshops on topical land use issues for public sector leaders. Recent subjects have included implementing approaches to green building, responding to multifamily foreclosures, and finding creative solutions to local fiscal challenges. In addition, the Rose Center provides a limited number of scholarships for public sector officials to attend the annual ULI Fall Meeting.
Rose Center Advisory Board

Joseph Rose, Chair
Partner
Georgetown Company
New York, New York

Seth Brown
Principal
Aspen Equities, LLC
Brooklyn, New York

Alex Garvin
President and CEO
Alex Garvin and Associates
Adjunct Professor
Yale University
New York, New York

Glenda E. Hood
President
Hood Partners, LLC
Orlando, Florida

William Hudnut III
Principal
Bill Hudnut Consultants, LLC
Chevy Chase, Maryland

Greg Johnson
President
Wright Runstad & Company
Seattle, Washington

Tom Murphy
Senior Resident Fellow
ULI/Klingbeil Family Chair for Urban Development
Washington, D.C.

Peter Rummell
Principal
Rummell Company, LLC
Jacksonville, Florida

Anthony A. Williams
Government Practice Executive Director
Corporate Executive Board
Arlington, Virginia

Rose Center Staff

Jess Zimbabwe
Executive Director
ULI Rose Center

Gideon Berger
Fellowship Director
ULI Rose Center

Alison Johnson
Program Manager
ULI Rose Center

Caroline Dietrich
Logistics Manager
ULI Education and Advisory Group

Ted Thoerig
Awards and Publications Manager
ULI Education and Advisory Group

Gosia Jasinski
Senior Associate
ULI Convenings Group

ULI Publications Staff

James A. Mulligan
Managing Editor

Laura Glassman, Publications Professionals LLC
Manuscript Editor

Betsy VanBuskirk
Creative Director

Anne Morgan
Graphic Design

Craig Chapman
Director, Publishing Operations
Detroit Rose Fellowship Team

Daniel Rose Fellows

Dave Bing
Mayor
City of Detroit

Karla Henderson
Planning and Facilities Group Executive
City of Detroit

Olga Stella
Vice President for Business Development
Detroit Economic Growth Corporation

Marja Winters
Deputy Director, Planning and Development Department
City of Detroit

Fellowship Team Coordinator

Dan Lijana
Communications Manager
City of Detroit
Rose Center Detroit Study Visit Panel

Rose Center Detroit Faculty and Panel Co-chairs

Calvin Gladney, Managing Partner
Mosaic Urban Partners LLC
Washington, D.C.

Mark Johnson
President, Civitas Inc.
Denver, Colorado

Panelists

Debra Campbell (Daniel Rose Fellow)
Director, Charlotte-Mecklenburg Planning Department
Charlotte, North Carolina

John Dangberg (Daniel Rose Fellow)
Assistant City Manager, City of Sacramento
Sacramento, California

Charmelle Hicks
President, CHPlanning
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania

Jim Noteware (Daniel Rose Fellow)
Director, Housing and Community Development Department, City of Houston
Houston, Texas

Richard Ward
Vice President for Development Management,
Zimmer Real Estate Services LLC
St. Louis, Missouri
Contents

Acknowledgments 8
Land Use Challenge and Summary of Recommendations 9
Panel Observations 13
Challenges and Opportunities 17
Recommendations 19
Concluding Thoughts and Next Steps 23
About the Fellows and the Panel 27
Interviews were conducted with numerous stakeholders, including neighborhood association members, business owners, representatives from the University of Detroit Mercy, staff from many city departments and the Detroit Economic Growth Corporation, and representatives of the real estate, community development, and urban design professions from ULI Detroit. These stakeholders provided invaluable information and diverse perspectives that greatly aided the panel’s understanding of the city’s land use challenge. The panel thanks all those who gave their time to be part of the process.

Acknowledgments

The ULI Rose Center would like to thank Detroit mayor Dave Bing, Planning and Facilities Group executive Karla Henderson, Planning and Development Department deputy director Marja Winters, and Detroit Economic Growth Corporation vice president Olga Stella for agreeing to be Daniel Rose Fellows. The Rose Center also thanks city of Detroit communications manager Dan Lijana for serving as the fellowship team coordinator and all the preceding for hosting this Rose Center city study visit panel. Special thanks go to Kim Tandy of University Commons and Shannon Sclafani and Eric Larson of ULI Detroit for their time and assistance during the panel’s visit.
Land Use Challenge and Summary of Recommendations

Located along the bustling Canadian border in southeast Michigan, the city of Detroit—the Motor City—is the heart of America’s 12th-largest metropolitan area. Although the city of Detroit’s population declined by 25 percent since 2000, falling to 713,777 according to the 2010 U.S. Census, it is still the 18th-most-populous U.S. city in a metropolitan area of nearly 4.3 million inhabitants.

The story of Detroit’s economic and physical decline has been told elsewhere and at great length. The story of its reinvention is still in its opening chapters. The Detroit metro area is the biggest exporting region and busiest commercial port in the United States, and it remains home to America’s Big Three automobile companies: General Motors, Ford, and Chrysler.

Downtown Detroit currently offers 68,000 jobs; its encompassing districts, more than another 65,000. Nearly all the top employers in the city (Detroit Public Schools, city government, Henry Ford Health System, and federal government) are either public or nonprofit; Detroit’s local economy is being driven by its anchor institutions (universities and medical centers) and innovative small business owners, as in most American central cities.

Downtown Detroit has also attracted significant reinvestment as beautiful historic buildings have been restored or converted to residential condominiums and apartments, which, along with award-winning public open-space projects such as Campus Martius Park, are bringing new vitality to the city of Detroit (light blue) is at the heart of a seven-county metropolitan area along the bustling Canadian border.
A consortium of foundations, including Hudson-Webber Foundation and Kresge Foundation, initiated the Midtown Anchor Strategy. This trend of foundations offering their financial resources and expertise to the city—others include the Skillman Foundation and the Community Foundation—has reenergized leaders in the public, private, and civic sectors. The Kresge Foundation also provided support for the city’s Detroit Works Project, a community planning process to reimagine land use in the city by focusing services on core areas. After a year of public process, Mayor Dave Bing in July 2011 announced the Detroit Works Project’s first major policy initiative: concentrating revitalization efforts on three demonstration areas as a short-term intervention strategy, which the city hopes to expand to other parts of the city after testing its efficacy.

Despite all these positive developments and the momentum they have generated, continuing pejorative media portrayals give the impression that Detroit houses few people other than those who cannot afford to leave. The reality could not be more different, as evidenced by the city’s work and experience in the Daniel Rose fellowship program.

**Land Use Challenge**

For its land use challenge, Mayor Bing and Detroit’s Rose fellowship team chose to focus on a very stable part of the city. With median household income of $68,548 (and average household income of $82,319, indicating some very high wage earners), compared to the citywide average of $37,234, the residents of the neighborhoods east and west of Livernois Avenue between McNichols Road and the city’s northern border at Eight Mile Road certainly have the means to relocate to nearby suburbs. Foreclosure and abandonment are extremely rare in these neighborhoods, which comprise about 11,000 households, and the few houses that are for sale do not stay on the market long. The residents of Green Acres, Sherwood Forest, Palmer Woods, the University District, and Bagley choose to stay downtown. Just outside downtown, a combination of affordable real estate prices and little competition has attracted a wave of small entrepreneurs to places like Corktown. The 43-acre Eastern Market (the largest public market in the United States) has emerged as a distribution center for local produce, meat, spices, and other products. And in the city’s Midtown section, a partnership between Wayne State University, Detroit Medical Center, and Henry Ford Health System is capturing anchor-generated demand within the neighborhood through organizations and programs targeting physical development, purchasing and hiring power, and potential for new residential and retail development.
because they love their neighborhoods, they love their city, and they believe in its future.

Nevertheless, this part of north Detroit faces real challenges and potential threats to its future vitality. Livernois, once known as the Avenue of Fashion, has struggled to maintain a high-quality and diverse retail mix that appeals to the local and regional markets. Although this problem is not unique to Livernois—the city’s retail leakage is estimated by the Detroit Economic Growth Corporation (DEGC) to be in excess of $1.5 billion annually, which translates into demand for roughly an additional 8 million square feet of retail space in the city across all retail sectors—the demographic data for this part of the city suggest that the corridor is underperforming its economic potential.

Especially between Seven Mile and Eight Mile roads, the commercial district known as the Avenue of Fashion used to be the go-to place for the best apparel in Detroit. It included numerous local businesses such as retail shops, art galleries, bookstores, medical offices, hair salons, and barbershops. During its heyday from the 1950s to the 1970s, this section of Livernois was full of customers; stores such as B. Siegel Company and historic venues like Baker’s Keyboard Lounge were popular regional attractions as well.

Today, vacancy estimates range between 10 percent and 30 percent along the corridor, and many older storefronts have an unkempt appearance. Yet recently a trend of new investment has begun, with a new sit-down, full-service restaurant and a couple of new clothing boutiques and art galleries. Livernois is also home to the University of Detroit Mercy (UDM), a private commuter college with more than 5,600 students that anchors the corridor south of McNichols Road, just north of its interchange with Lodge Freeway. The smaller Marygrove College—with about 1,300 students—is located about a mile to the west of Livernois Avenue on McNichols as well. And the corridor has active business organizations and community groups in the adjacent neighborhoods.

Detroit’s Rose fellowship team asked the Rose Center to help the city and its partners develop a roadmap to return Livernois Avenue to its former role as a thriving urban main street, specifically focusing on how to improve its retail offerings, address parking problems, work with a diverse group of property owners, improve lighting and the perception of safety, and give it an attractive aesthetic identity.

Although Livernois’s problems may seem slight compared to parts of Detroit suffering from large-scale abandonment, the Detroit Rose fellowship team saw this challenge as complementary to the question of how to repurpose largely vacant sections of the city. For Detroit to have a vibrant
future, it must find a way to turn around struggling commercial corridors like Livernois in choice neighborhoods such as these, where market strength and social capacity already exist.

Summary of Recommendations

The panel organized its recommendations to the city’s Rose fellowship team into five broad areas:

- **Create nodes:** Concentrate development, economic pursuits, and human activity in focused nodes along the two-mile study area corridor, which by comparison is four times longer than nearby Ferndale’s thriving Nine Mile Road commercial center.

- **Change by design:** Improve the built environment and physical infrastructure along the corridor with new designs that can address building aesthetics, streetscape, traffic flow, parking, pedestrian comfort, and safety.

- **Market and brand:** Livernois’s old identity as the “Avenue of Fashion” is only a memory and no longer resonates with contemporary conditions and opportunities. A new identity for Livernois needs to be aggressively promoted and should embrace its adjacent neighborhoods as well as the avenue itself.

- **Build capacity:** The strong social networks along Livernois need support and mentoring to become adept at bricks-and-mortar community development. UDM is a sleeping giant on the corridor and could hold a potential key to its economic revival in part by refocusing its current community support and engagement agenda and in part by embracing local market and redesign opportunities.

- **Activate government:** In contrast to its roles in the sections of Detroit struggling with abandonment, city government needs to act as a resource for community-led initiatives and provide support for small entrepreneurship along Livernois. Other key roles will be to act as a partner with and as a facilitator between the neighborhoods, corridor businesses, and property owners and UDM.
Panel Observations

The panel was briefed by Detroit’s Rose fellowship team, toured the Livernois Avenue corridor between McNichols and Eight Mile roads, and interviewed stakeholders, including local businesses, property owners, and neighborhood residents. The panel also toured the nearby Nine Mile Road commercial district in suburban Ferndale, which is where many Livernois area residents currently shop, as well as the Vernor corridor in Mexicantown, an example of a revitalizing neighborhood commercial corridor in the city.

The panel was impressed by the extant assets it observed in the vicinity of the Livernois corridor. These include business associations and partnerships, active neighborhood organizations, some new investment by local entrepreneurs, potentially robust but relatively untapped local markets, and a strong desire by stakeholders to improve the number and mix of businesses, visual aesthetics, multimodal access, and perception of safety along the corridor.

Built Environment and Infrastructure

The panel was able to observe much about the quality and character of the built environment and infrastructure of the corridor and its surrounding neighborhoods. The panel compared its observations to both the nearby Nine Mile Road corridor in Ferndale and the Vernor corridor in Mexicantown to draw conclusions about the performance of the three neighborhood commercial districts.

The panel noted the presence of alleys (about 20 feet wide) separating Livernois’s shallow commercial lots of about 75 feet from the residential neighborhoods behind the corridor. These alleys back up against the backyards of adjacent homes. Many of the older commercial buildings have back doors, now blocked for security reasons, which once were used as entrances from the neighborhoods.

Although differences clearly exist west and east of Livernois, the housing stock in the adjacent neighborhoods—overwhelmingly detached, single-family, brick, and built in the early- to mid-20th century—is well maintained and highly desirable overall. Homes to the east of Livernois Avenue are generally larger with bigger lots (especially in the curvilinear-street neighborhoods of Sherwood Forest and Palmer Woods, and in the section abutting the Detroit Golf Club). In the gridded-street Bagley neighborhood west of Livernois Avenue, the homes are still mostly in good condition and well maintained. Neighborhoods like these would constitute high-value real...
The neighborhoods around Livernois include some of Detroit’s finest housing stock.

The University of Detroit Mercy has a long fence along its Livernois Avenue edge.

Don Studvent in front of his 1917 American Bistro.

The quality of the commercial building stock along Livernois itself and the pedestrian experience along the street are mixed. The east side of Livernois Avenue, south of McNichols Road, is the UDM campus. The campus is inwardly focused; facing Livernois is a high fence with few entry points and fewer buildings. The intersection of Livernois and McNichols is dominated by automobiles with a fenced UDM athletic field on the southeast corner, a gas station and McDonald’s on the two northern corners, and a parking lot on the southwest corner. Between McNichols and Seven Mile roads are predominantly one-story commercial buildings; newer ones may have automobile-oriented uses, large signage, and surface parking; some older buildings are unkempt in appearance or vacant. Uses include some that are automobile oriented, such as body shops, repair shops, and used-car dealers, along with takeout- and fast-food retailers; some professional services such as medical offices, attorneys’ offices, and a printer; medium-format retailers such discount stores, supermarkets, and drugstores; a few banks; and vacant lots or empty buildings interspersed between.

From Clarita Avenue, a block (one-tenth of a mile) south of Seven Mile Road, until St. Martin’s Avenue (about three-eighths of a mile north of Seven Mile Road), the commercial buildings along Livernois form a more consistent street facade, with fewer curb cuts and parking lots. Nearly block-long rows of older commercial buildings provide a sense of enclosure along the street, although not all of these buildings are well maintained or occupied. This approximately half-mile stretch (from Clarita to St. Martin’s) is also home to a number of new businesses, including a sit-down restaurant, 1917 American Bistro. In contrast to the intersection with McNichols Road, the intersection of Seven Mile Road and Livernois Avenue has three buildings (although two are vacant—the former Cunningham Drug store and Kresge dime store—a Payless Shoes is on the northeast corner) and a gas station on its southeast corner. The old B. Siegel department store (now vacant) was located on the south side of Seven Mile Road just west of Livernois Avenue.
The five-eighths of a mile north of St. Martin’s Avenue to Eight Mile Road is again dominated by curb cuts and parking lots, and more automobile-oriented (rather than neighborhood market-oriented) uses such as gas stations and auto repair shops, and a very large church. Just south of the intersection with Eight Mile Road (the city’s border with Ferndale) is the famous Baker’s Keyboard Lounge, which claims to be the world’s oldest operating jazz club (since 1934). It was rescued from bankruptcy in 2011 by its manager, who vowed to keep this Detroit tradition alive after purchasing the club with partners.

The Livernois right-of-way (building front to building front), at about 125 feet, is wide but feels even wider because of the low scale of its buildings and the parking lots accessed directly from the street by curb cuts. A recently constructed median has proved controversial among both neighborhood residents and businesses. Built with state funding to reduce pedestrian-auto conflicts along the corridor, which is a major artery into and out of the city, the design limited the ability of cars to make left turns and U turns and created a narrow turning radius for delivery trucks, to the dismay of store owners. The design also lacked aesthetic improvements such as plants or art, because there was no funding to maintain them. Residents and businesses also complained about the loss of on-street parking in certain places.

Comparison to the Nine Mile Road Corridor in Ferndale

Located only a mile north of the study area’s northern boundary is the Nine Mile Road shopping district in Ferndale, a commercial district stretching about four-tenths of a mile between Livernois and Woodward avenues, where many of the study area residents say they do the preponderance of their shopping. A primarily residential city of less than 20,000, Ferndale is an inner-ring suburb of Detroit. Nine Mile Road includes numerous privately owned shops, storefronts, dance clubs, bars, and restaurants.

Nine Mile Road, the commercial main street in neighboring Ferndale.
Like Detroit’s Livernois corridor, the Nine Mile Road shopping district in Ferndale declined, starting in the 1970s as new suburban retail centers were built. However, Nine Mile Road has experienced a dramatic revival because of policies implemented by the city over the past 15 years. Ferndale made the corridor more pedestrian-friendly by narrowing Nine Mile Road in the heart of its shopping district to one lane in each direction and adding on-street parking. The result has been a return of pedestrian traffic and an influx of new stores and restaurants.

In comparison with Livernois Avenue in Detroit, Nine Mile Road is only 75 feet wide in its retail core. The street has a uniform urban design with pedestrian-scale lighting and benches. Large, off-street parking lots are located behind the stores, which on Livernois are tightly packed against adjacent homes separated only by a narrow alley. No median and left-turn lanes are located at intersections with cross streets, emphasizing vehicular access rather than throughput as Livernois’s design does.

**Comparison to the Vernor Corridor in Southwest Detroit**

West Vernor Highway is a major commercial artery in southwest Detroit. For a nearly a 1.5-mile stretch between the Fisher Freeway (Interstate 75) and Livernois Avenue, it serves as a neighborhood main street. As a predominantly Mexican American and immigrant community, its context is different from that of the Livernois corridor. But this is one of the few sections in Detroit that has experienced growth in the past two decades. The local economy has thrived in the past ten years, as evidenced by the numerous local businesses on Vernor.

Unlike Ferndale, Mexicantown’s infrastructure has enjoyed little direct city investment. It has no pedestrian-scale lights or street furniture, and the right-of-way (a two-way, two-lane design with on-street parking in both directions) was not redesigned. However, banners are hung from the street lights, a relatively inexpensive design element.

But the biggest difference from Livernois is the vitality of the businesses and low number of vacancies. Buildings have been knocked down to create off-street parking in places, and not every corner has strong buildings to create a sense of place, but enough buildings are standing to give a sense of vitality and enclosure to pedestrians.

The Vernor corridor is also anchored by a large public park on the south side of the street, Clark Park. It is well landscaped and provides paths and places for passive uses. The only open space along the Livernois corridor is the UMD campus, which is fenced off from the public. Another key visual difference from Livernois Avenue is the presence of many large murals on the sides of buildings, mostly depicting scenes that resonate with the culture of the Mexicantown neighborhood. These works of mural art help create a sense of vitality along Vernor by making even empty buildings seem active.
Challenges and Opportunities

The panel saw several key challenges and opportunities for the potential of Livernois Avenue, based on its tours and meetings with stakeholders. The panel specifically addresses those posed by parking, the condition of the building stock, the corridor’s current state of urban design, and its economic condition. These conditions and needs deserve careful attention and consideration by the city and its partners.

Built Environment

Many good buildings still exist, but their facades need improvement; outdated signs and security measures such as gates and bars are uninviting. In places that have two-story buildings, these create opportunities for residential occupancy on the upper levels along the avenue.

Several buildings are of questionable design value from their scale, color, and signage, creating a sense of visual discord. Some recently developed retail along the corridor, such as the University Shops shopping center, has brought new activity. But the format of the newer development, with parking in front of the stores, has weakened the pedestrian environment.

Urban Design

The street trees, while protecting pedestrians from cars, also hide the business signs. Although the avenue seems not to have enough trees, those trees that exist seem spaced too close together. The many automobile-oriented uses and curb cuts provide pedestrians with little sense of safety or comfort.

Buildings like the one on this corner could be renovated as commercial space on the ground floor with other uses on the second floor.
The median design has been a source of frustration for some stakeholders.

The median was designed to help pedestrian safety but has frustrated stakeholders by making vehicular access more difficult. Poor pedestrian spaces exist where the sidewalk is quite narrow and uncomfortably close to automobiles.

Although some have shelters, the bus stops along Livernois Avenue do not have an inviting urban design. Some beautification efforts have been made though murals, but not on the scale seen along the Vernor corridor in Mexicantown, where murals also connote the corridor’s identity and help brand it.

Parking

As observed along Nine Mile Road in Ferndale, the presence of common parking is critical for the capacity of main street businesses. The panel clearly saw that the on-street parking on Livernois Avenue is insufficient to meet current and projected needs. Common parking is preferable to business-specific parking because the latter increases business dependency and discourages multiple-destination trips among shoppers, who would rather park once to visit nearby shops. Common parking is also more efficient than business-specific, which requires each use to provide for its own peak parking demand.

Some key considerations for common parking include limiting or avoiding parking lots that break the streetfront. These can discourage pedestrian traffic because of the inconvenience of looking over one’s shoulder at busy curb cuts. Edge locations at the end of a row of shops are optimal, because they feed multiple stores and businesses. Payment systems are also critical: one should not inadvertently discourage patronage with complicated systems that create nuisance and inconvenience shoppers.

The “missing teeth,” where buildings have been torn down, while representing breaks in the urban fabric are potentially usable as off-street parking, especially as an interim use. Although businesses and churches showed some interest in sharing parking (an ideal partnership based on their different peaks demand periods), concerns about property liability have prevented those ideas from being implemented to date.

Economic Activity

Some clusters of businesses are successful, and the recent trend of new entrepreneurship has brought some new vitality and energy to the avenue. But some of the few remaining old standbys along Livernois Avenue are at risk, as recently demonstrated by Baker’s Keyboard Lounge. The numerous vacant buildings and lots raise questions about the value and security of real estate along the corridor, discouraging additional investment.
Recommendations

The panel organized its recommendations to the city’s Rose fellowship team into five broad areas:

- Create nodes;
- Change by design;
- Market and brand;
- Build capacity; and
- Activate government.

Create Nodes

The late urban designer Kevin Lynch defined nodes as areas of concentrated activity, often located at the intersections of key streets or at a particular block that makes up the heart of a specific district. The human and economic activity embodied at a node typically radiates out into the surrounding streets and blocks, making it an important destination. Commercial real estate brokers often refer to a very large node as a “100 percent corner,” a place of maximum exposure that in turn generates tremendous commercial real estate value.

The panel recommends that the city, the stakeholders, and their partners focus on specific nodes along Livernois Avenue to coordinate urban design ideas and elements and concentrate initial implementation resources. A nodal focus that bundles resources in specific parts of the corridor (rather than spreading limited investment along the entire two miles) has more of a chance to create noticeable changes and effects that in turn will build momentum for the rest of Livernois. However, the panel noted that a nodal approach is just one strategy and that other recommendations could be applied corridorwide.

The panel proposed two types of nodal selection criteria: physical and stakeholder driven. Physical selection criteria could include places no longer than a quarter-mile in length where a concentration of occupied storefronts exists with activity on both sides of the street and opportunities for shared parking. Stakeholder-driven criteria could include places where a majority of merchants are stable and established, with reasonable expectations of financial support from property owners or merchants and where vacant parcels are actively being managed or marketed.

Some nodes for consideration proposed by the panel included Seven Mile Road at Livernois and Nine Mile Road in Ferndale. In comparison with concentrated nodes, sustaining retail over such a long area is difficult.
Avenue, Livernois between Cambridge Avenue and Outer Drive, and McNichols Road at Livernois (as part of a UDM-driven strategy), but this list was not at all exhaustive.

Change by Design

The panel emphasized several key urban design elements that need immediate attention along Livernois Avenue, including parking, street design, streetscape, and building facades. Design solutions can help calm traffic, improve public safety, better connect the corridor to adjacent neighborhoods, enhance beautification and aesthetics to create a visual identity for Livernois, and address parking needs:

- **Traffic calming**: In the short term, the city should work with the Michigan Department of Transportation to determine what modifications can be made to the existing median design. Bulb-outs at pedestrian crossings and bicycle lanes should be considered either on the corridor or an alternative route, and connections should be made from east–west routes into the neighborhoods. Sidewalks need to be widened wherever possible to provide more pedestrian comfort and space for sidewalk dining; street humps can be used to slow traffic in key places.

- **Public safety**: Pedestrian-scale lighting (not just streetlights) will provide a safer environment, security cameras pointed at the street from businesses can help deter crime, and traffic calming measures will ensure more drivers can make eye contact with pedestrians and not speed through the corridor. The best source of public safety will be increased pedestrian activity from more businesses and programming, creating a virtuous cycle of eyes on the street that deters crimes of opportunity and creates a self-policing environment.

- **Neighborhood connections**: Directional signage for vehicles and pedestrians, and maps showing the adjacent neighborhoods and distances will help bridge the psychological barrier between the neighborhoods and the corridor.

- **Beautification**: An adopt-a-median program with local merchants and neighborhood associations can help beautify the corridor. The city should pursue funding incentive opportunities for facade improvements and seek to fund streetscape improvements that address the pedestrian environment and provide opportunities for merchants to bring life to the street.

- **Identity**: A common theme of signage, street furniture (e.g., lights, benches), and branding of that theme will help give Livernois Avenue a strong new identity that can be used to market and grow the area.

The panel had several recommendations to address parking challenges:

- Assess potential future building uses and parking required for retail shopping, dining, and entertainment; office uses; and future residential development.

- Assess options to meet future parking needs on street, behind buildings using alley access, and between buildings using alley or frontage access.

- Determine parking financing and supporting revenue that can be generated through some combination of the following: development fees, metered parking, an improvement district tax, or a merchant reimbursement program.

- Secure sites, and design, finance, and build common parking solutions that can be shared along the corridor.

The panel suggested the following case studies that can be used to learn from:

- Ferndale’s Nine Mile Road corridor, which has alley access on the north side of the street and a service road on the south side with parking beyond;

- Royal Oak’s North Main Street corridor, where the city initially built parking lots, then later replaced surface lots with two garages; and

- Delmar Loop in St. Louis, Missouri’s University City district, where the city initially built surface lots (both metered and free), then built an infill parking garage with ground-level retail, and finally built a large commercial lot behind storefronts.
The panel believes that the Livernois corridor needs a new identity; its history as the Avenue of Fashion will not carry the future. But whatever new identity is determined, it must be for the entire district—encompassing the neighborhoods and local institutions such as UDM—not just for the avenue itself.

The various elements of the corridor should support the eventual brand, including the urban design ideas previously discussed: building facades, signage, landscaping, management of the right-of-way and privately owned public realm, and communication and advertising for the district.

**Build Capacity**

All the appropriate partners need to be at the table to build the capacity of the Livernois district. These include merchants, property owners, residents, universities, city government, and existing public and private organizations that are already active here. A successful district needs indigenous leadership that provides services to local businesses, is a mechanism for raising financing, serves as a catalyst for collaboration, provides an identity for branding the district, and is strongly linked to delivery of city services. Specific responsibilities for this organization include public safety and maintenance, economic and business development, marketing and communications, capital projects and planning, and construction.

The panel believes a district organization should keep in mind important goals as it moves toward implementing changes on Livernois Avenue, including building on the presence of the two nearby universities, establishing a corridorwide enterprise zone or some other tax incentive program for business development, and incorporating multifamily housing as a key future land use along the corridor—especially in the areas between the commercial nodes and as an upper-story use above retail or neighborhood offices.

The presence of the two universities should be exploited as a potential new residential market that is seeking smaller, rental real estate products. The panel feels UDM is a sleeping giant on the corridor and could hold a potential key to its economic revival: in part by refocusing its current community support and engagement agenda, and in part by embracing local market and redesign opportunities. A good case study is offered by new student-driven rental development around Temple University in north Philadelphia, which in turn led to new markets for commercial development such as a grocery store and movie theater. This development would also curb the current practice of students pooling resources to rent large homes in the neighborhoods.

The University Commons organization, supported financially by UDM and the city since 2002 and led by Kim Tandy, has been a catalyst and forum for bringing together stakeholders and providing leadership along the Livernois corridor. University Commons has worked with various government, neighborhood, and merchant organizations; has organized programming; and provides one possible new branding identity for the corridor. It currently does not have sufficient capacity to conduct brick-and-mortar community development such as capital infrastructure projects, new housing or commercial development, or economic development and entrepreneurship-support initiatives.

The panel strongly urges the city, the stakeholders, and their partners to build on and leverage their successes with University Commons into a broader community development organization with the skills and abilities previously described. This can be done by folding University Commons as a marketing and outreach component into a bricks-and-mortar community/economic development corporation (CDC) model; by finding the financial resources to expand University Commons to include those skills and expertise; or by developing them within University Commons through relationships with existing, high-capacity CDCs, UDM’s Detroit Collaborative Design Center, or other partners and mentors. This kind of community development capacity is critical for the Livernois district so it can act as a civic partner with the government and business sectors to implement desired changes.
Activate Government

Livernois Avenue (and places like it in Detroit) also need the support of city government if they are to thrive in the future. The city needs to devote both staff and other resources to this district and places like it or else they will continue their slow decline despite their abundant potential and strong adjacent neighborhoods. This support is consistent with the market-based approach currently being implemented as part of the Detroit Works Project’s short-term actions strategy.

This will require a culture shift at the city in that Livernois needs it to act more as a facilitator than as a regulator. Although code enforcement is still critical for the district, it also needs entrepreneurial development services such as a one-stop shop small-project expediter and delivery of economic development incentives that can cut through red tape, which can make the difference between success and failure for a financially fragile small business.

Small business support and development in neighborhood commercial corridors is as critical to Detroit’s future as is luring large employers to downtown, midtown, and other employment clusters. These functions can be performed by existing city departments or through other public agencies. But for Detroit to thrive economically at all levels, it will need to provide opportunities for businesses of all sizes that serve many different markets, which means government must play a critical role in supporting small businesses that can succeed and help transform neighborhoods. Other key roles will be to act as a partner with and as a facilitator between UDM and the neighborhoods, corridor businesses, and property owners.
Concluding Thoughts and Next Steps

The panel believes the Livernois corridor district has great assets and opportunities. Its adjacent neighborhoods are physically strong with beautiful housing stock and socially strong with residents and homeowners who care deeply about their city and choose to stay in Detroit because of their belief in its future. Livernois Avenue has a rich history and is attracting incremental new investment by entrepreneurs who share the optimism of neighborhood residents. The presence of UDM and Marygrove College provide the district with anchor institutions that can be strong partners and support a new market for growth and economic development, a template that is being successfully used with larger institutions in the Midtown district.

Nevertheless, real challenges exist that will need to be addressed for these opportunities to be realized. The local and national real estate markets are still struggling, and access to capital is still harder than it should be for those with good histories. Livernois’s old identity as the Avenue of Fashion may not carry the future. Numerous physical conditions along the corridor, including the critical issue of parking and access, need to be addressed with new design changes that require public and private investment.
Community-Driven Change

Change on Livernois needs to be community driven. The stakeholders cannot look to the city or other institutions to be the catalyst: they have to be the force for change themselves and aggressively solicit support and partnerships with government, business, and institutional players. The panel believes the community has the ability to play this role as long as it remains mindful of the ultimate outcomes it desires and presents a unified voice without being distracted by differences of opinion on tactics or measures. Mexicantown offers another example of corridor revitalization that was nurtured by the city but driven by the community.

The five groups of recommendations offered by the panel—creating nodes, changing by design, marketing and branding, building capacity, and activating government—can provide a blueprint for addressing Livernois’s needs and a roadmap for future actions. But keeping in mind the interrelatedness of the corridor’s and the neighborhoods’ stability is critical. Livernois today is an underperforming asset for the neighborhoods and the city. Given its vehicular traffic and local market, it should be generating tax revenue for the city and providing amenities for its neighbors that in turn raise the value of their investments. At best it is currently perceived as a liability that has strong potential and is trending positive. But if existing conditions prevail without more change and support, over time the neighborhoods will continue their slow but inexorable decline in value, which will lead to bigger problems. Successful actions today by the community, the private market, and government can make all the difference in Livernois’s future.

The panel gave the city’s Rose fellowship team the following tasks as homework assignments for the remaining nine months of the program:

- Lead the selection of nodes based on the proposed criteria.
- Support the creation of a district coalition.
- Facilitate learning between that group and successful CDCs.
Follow-up Actions

In August 2011, the Rose Center’s staff and faculty advisers (Calvin Gladney and Mark Johnson, the study visit panel cochairs) facilitated a meeting between the city’s Rose fellows and new UDM president Antoine Garibaldi, who was appointed in June 2011, to talk about the city’s focus on Livernois and the university’s current and potential roles in the corridor’s revitalization. This engagement is hoped to help set a path toward a new and stronger partnership.

At the final meeting of the 2011-2012 Rose fellows in October 2011 in Los Angeles, the city’s fellowship team presented many actions they have taken to begin implementing the panel’s recommendations.

Activating Government

In accordance with the panel’s recommendations, the city and its partners are taking the following steps:

- The city has increased code enforcement, targeting problem spots along the corridor, but it has also embraced the view of government as an enabler and partner, not just as a regulator.
- The city has assembled a team from various government levels (state of Michigan, Wayne County, and the city of Detroit) to pool ideas and potential public resources.
- Making a crucial connection to Mayor Bing’s signature planning effort, the Detroit Works Project, the city designated the Livernois corridor as part of one of its three demonstration areas in the first phase of the project, ensuring continued city focus on the area to develop replicable models.

Building Capacity

In accordance with the panel’s recommendations, the city and its partners are taking the following steps:

- The city has recognized that many competing organizations are active on Livernois, and they are not necessarily partnering or leveraging their efforts. The city is working to facilitate collaboration.
- The DEGC in September 2011 brought on staff to focus on neighborhood commercial and retail strategies through Wayne State University’s Detroit Revitalization Fellows Program.
- The city’s Rose fellowship team convened a Livernois corridor working group in September to build on past input, coordinate with ongoing engagement efforts, and seed ownership of intended outcomes. Members of the working group to date include representatives of city government, the DEGC, University Commons, UDM, Marygrove College, Wayne County Economic Development Growth Engine, and the BING Institute. Others will include the Michigan Economic Development Corporation, Michigan State Housing Development Authority, and neighborhood group leadership. The group is focused on outcomes that include creating a destination, promoting a pedestrian-friendly environment, and supporting engagement—socially or with the physical environment.
- The DEGC applied to the Kresge Foundation for a grant to fund streetscape improvement designs.

Focusing on Nodes

Stakeholder prioritization to define the nodal focus on Livernois is still needed, but the city saw some obvious choices based on partner activities:

- From Seven Mile Road to Outer Drive (Beta Site project, discussed below);
- At McNichols Road (linkage to Marygrove College, gateway to UDM); and
- At the Lodge Freeway (regional gateway).

Changing by Design

In terms of streetscape improvements, a grant is anticipated from the Kresge Foundation to pay for streetscape design and construction drawings, and the DEGC (the recipient) will issue a request for proposals for consultants to perform the work. The streetscape plan will research parking, enhance medians and sidewalks, improve lighting and landscaping, and prioritize and phase implementation. The city is supportive of working with the team to identify resources for construction.

University Commons has selected Seven Mile Road and Livernois Avenue as the highest-priority node in its Beta Site project, which would create a model for
The Livernois corridor working group has begun five projects:

- **Storefront staging and murals**: This project will activate vacant storefronts and public spaces with temporary and permanent art installations. The project will leverage local university and K–12 students along with prominent artists in the community to create the art projects. Pop-up retail is also being explored.

- **Arts council**: Prominent local artists, business owners, residents, and university officials are forming an arts council to pursue arts-based funding and implement projects. Rose DeSloover, Marygrove College’s dean of visual and performing arts, is championing this initiative.

- **Development and implementation of a website and social media**: This effort focuses on elevating the brand of the Livernois corridor by creating a web presence.

- **Implementation of business incentives and tools**: This project brings together Livernois Avenue business and property owners to identify and solve common problems in partnership with the DEGC and the local CDC. Organizational structures to jointly fund security and streetscape maintenance are currently being explored. The effort will also help connect business owners to technical assistance such as business planning and marketing.

- **Windmill market**: This project focuses on improving the neighborhood farmers market through signage and marketing.

Marketing and Branding

The Livernois corridor working group has prioritized developing a new corridor identity, which will inform the business attraction strategy. The streetscape design project provides an opportunity to use design as an element in branding. Since the Rose Center’s study visit in January 2011, a number of positive stories in the media about Livernois’s unique small businesses have drawn attention to the corridor.

Next Steps

As immediate next steps, the city will continue to work with the Livernois corridor working group on priority projects; the DEGC will award the streetscape design contract and complete the plan; and the city will explore opportunities for other anchor institution strategies and advance strategies related to the Detroit Works Project demonstration area.

The Beta Site project will emphasize facade improvements and sustainable exterior lighting and will be integrated with the streetscape plan. The city of Detroit is providing funding for the facade improvements through federal grant dollars.

Other opportunities for design include a review and update of the city’s corridor design guidelines, a UDM design studio, a possible mural program run by University Commons, and a possible artscape project to incorporate art in the median and vacant storefronts with community engagement. In addition, UDM is beginning an internal process to consider streetfront property development.
About the Fellows and the Panel

DANIEL ROSE DETROIT FELLOWS

Dave Bing

Not often, if at all, can one claim success in three distinct areas—professional sports, business, and politics. Yet Dave Bing did just that when he was elected the 62nd mayor of the city of Detroit in May 2009. A native of Washington, D.C., Bing is a graduate of Syracuse University where he earned his BA in economics and was later bestowed an honorary doctorate of laws in 2006. He was also a standout basketball player and an All American in both high school and college.

Bing came to Detroit in 1966, when he was drafted by the Detroit Pistons as their number-one pick. He played nine of his 12 years in the National Basketball Association with the Pistons and was named to the All-Star Team eight times during his career. Voted one of the top 50 basketball players of all time, Bing was inducted into the Michigan Hall of Fame in 1984 and into the Naismith Hall of Fame in 1990.

In 1980, Bing turned his winning strategies from the basketball court to the boardroom as the founder of an automotive supply corporation, the Bing Group, where he served as president and chairman until April 2009. Within a decade, the Bing Group was recognized as one of the nation’s top Minority-Owned Companies by Black Enterprise.

Answering yet another call to serve, Bing decided to run for mayor to help rebuild a city that he has loved and been a part of for more than 40 years. Proving that the basics of good performance, integrity, and business can be applied to any area or industry, Bing has brought a renewed sense of trust and hope to the city of Detroit. He has already laid the groundwork for solid city government by instituting the toughest ethics ordinance in the city’s history and making the tough but necessary decisions to stabilize the city’s finances.

Karla Henderson

Karla Henderson was appointed by Mayor Dave Bing as the group executive of planning and facilities on August 2, 2011. With more than 14 years of increasingly responsible management experience in the administration of public services and resources, Henderson oversees the Buildings, Safety Engineering and Environmental Department; the Building Authority; the Planning and Development Department; the Land Use plan; and the mayor’s Demolition Program. Henderson’s original appointment by Mayor Bing was as the director of the Buildings, Safety Engineering and Engineering Department in July 2009.

Before joining the city of Detroit, Henderson was manager of the Field Operations Services Unit for the city of Ann Arbor, Michigan. In this capacity she was responsible for the overall management and strategic planning for the unit, including planning, coordinating, and directing the operations of the water, sewer, storm utility system, park operations and forestry, natural area preservation, refuse and recycling collection, street maintenance, signs and signals, radios, technical services and the compost center. She also participated in labor management processes.

From 1996 to 2001, Henderson served as director of special programs for the city of Highland Park, Michigan. Her primary responsibilities were developing operational budgets, developing a master plan, supervising and directing staff, maintaining city facilities, evaluating community needs, future programs and special events for the city.

Henderson holds a BS in public resource management from the Michigan State University and resides in Detroit.
Olga Stella

Olga Stella is vice president for business development at the Detroit Economic Growth Corporation. In this position, she helps lead DEGC’s business attraction, retention, and expansion efforts on behalf of the city of Detroit.

Previously, Stella held positions within the DEGC that focused on policy development, special initiatives, strategic partnerships, and project management. Prior to rejoining the DEGC in 2007, she served as chief of staff for State Representative Steve Tobocman. As chief of staff, Stella handled Rep. Tobocman’s policy agenda, communications, and community initiatives. Their work focused on economic and community development, neighborhood revitalization, immigration, and social justice/civil rights issues.

Stella began working in economic development in Detroit as assistant to Mayor Dennis W. Archer for economic development in 2000, after a short period as a business analyst at McKinsey and Company. In this role, she worked directly with the city’s chief development officer on innovative strategies and programs to overcome critical economic challenges faced by the city and to revitalize Detroit neighborhoods. She held an instrumental role in managing and resolving issues associated with major city development projects.

Marja Winters

On May 14, 2009, Mayor Dave Bing reappointed Marja M. Winters deputy director of the City of Detroit Planning and Development Department. In this capacity, she oversees the operations of nearly 200 employees who staff the department’s six divisions: Financial and Resources Management, Housing Services, Neighborhood Support Services, Planning, Real Estate Development, and the Office of Neighborhood Commercial Revitalization (ONCR), where she served as director the preceding two years.

As director of the ONCR, Winters worked with community development organizations, volunteers, entrepreneurs, and local merchants to revitalize older commercial districts in targeted areas and encouraged small business creation and growth. Before joining the city of Detroit, Wayne County executive Robert A. Ficano appointed Winters as department executive for Wayne County Parks. While serving three years in this capacity, she worked on several special projects including leading the campaign to renew the parks millage, developed the framework for Wayne Reads! – a comprehensive literacy program—and managed a collaboration to reduce violence and promote conflict resolution throughout Wayne County.

A career public servant, Winters displays her commitment to the city of Detroit through her profession and her strong community involvement. Respected among her peers in the young professional community, Winters is a visible and vocal advocate for civil rights, community empowerment, and civic engagement. She is third vice-president of the Detroit Branch NAACP Executive Committee, chair of the Detroit Branch NAACP’s Political Education Committee, co-adviser to the Detroit NAACP Youth Council, team leader of the Community and Economic Development Ministry, and Children’s Church Instructor at Life Changers International Ministries. In January 2008, Winters was appointed by Governor Jennifer Granholm to serve a two-year term on the Michigan Judicial Tenure Commission.

Winters is a current student of the Urban Ministry Institute. A graduate of the University of Michigan, she holds a BA in political science and a master’s of urban planning.
Calvin Gladney

Calvin Gladney is a public/private partnership strategist, real estate developer, and trusted adviser to organizations seeking to sustainably transform urban communities.

Gladney is managing partner of Mosaic Urban Partners LLC, a real estate development and advisory services firm based in Washington, D.C. Mosaic has a passion for public/private partnerships, and its core purpose is to transform urban communities. Prior to founding Mosaic, Gladney served as vice president of the Anacostia Waterfront Corporation (AWC), a District of Columbia quasi-public real estate corporation, where he assisted the CEO with the management of the corporation and was the project manager for a $1 billion mixed-use redevelopment of 67 acres of District-controlled land.

Prior to his tenure at AWC, Gladney was general counsel and transactions manager at BRIDGE Housing Corporation, a private developer in San Francisco, California. At BRIDGE, Gladney was the lead business person in the investment of $60 million of CalPERS equity in multiple real estate development deals. He also provided strategic advice on the development or management of more than 2,700 apartment units throughout California.

Before his tenure at BRIDGE, Gladney was the first senior development director and counsel at the National Capital Revitalization Corporation (NCRC), a quasi-public District of Columbia real estate corporation. Gladney managed the acquisition of NCRC’s $1 billion government real estate portfolio and helped select private developers for over $250 million of residential and retail development projects. Prior to his tenure at NCRC, Gladney was a transactional real estate attorney at Latham & Watkins in Washington, D.C.

Gladney graduated cum laude from Harvard Law School, received his BS from Cornell University, and is a LEED Accredited Professional. He is a member of ULI’s national Public/Private Partnership Council (Blue Flight) and a member of the Executive Committee of ULI’s Washington, D.C., District Council. He is also a member of the Sustainable Business Network of Washington, D.C., and the DC Building Industry Association. Gladney is an adjunct professor at Georgetown University’s Masters in Real Estate Program, where he coteaches a class on real estate entrepreneurship.

Mark Johnson

Mark Johnson is a leading landscape architect, designer of public space, and strategist for the regeneration of core cities. He is currently leading the regeneration planning for the decayed Northside of downtown St. Louis, the design of the North Embarcadero in San Diego, and a master plan for the waterfront on the Harlem River in the Inwood neighborhood of Manhattan.

Johnson is a core member of the Working Group for Sustainable Cities at Harvard, an arm of the Harvard Center for the Environment; a lecturer with the Institute of Design and Health, Stockholm; and a regular lecturer and participant in urban vision and community-building strategies with the Urban Land Institute and several universities.

Johnson has led many complex projects that have had a transformative impact on cities: three riverfront parks in Denver; a master plan for Balboa Park in San Diego; a waterfront plan for Memphis; and a corridor plan to connect historic neighborhoods along Brooklyn’s Atlantic Avenue. He recently completed the Los Angeles River Revitalization Master Plan, a project that immediately gained national recognition for its economic, social, and environmental impact to revive economic, environmental, and social health over the length of this 32-mile forgotten resource.

Johnson has been deeply involved in the redevelopment of the Stapleton International Airport in Denver continuously since 1988 and is a primary au-
Debra Campbell

Daniel Rose Charlotte Fellow

As planning director for the joint City - County Planning Department, Debra Campbell is responsible for planning services for the city of Charlotte and works closely with the Charlotte - Mecklenburg Planning Commission. The department oversees rezoning, historic district designation, subdivision administration, annexation, and capital needs assessment processes. It also provides staff support for long-range transportation planning (Mecklenburg - Union Metropolitan Planning Organization), zoning administration, and interpretation.

Campbell joined the City - County Planning Department in 1988 as a senior planner and held several positions, including interim director, assistant planning director, and planning division manager, before being named planning director in 2004. She began her full-time public service career with the Tennessee State Planning Office and was a housing consultant with the Enterprise Foundation/Chattanooga Neighborhood Enterprise before moving to Charlotte. She received her master’s degree in public administration and her bachelor’s degree in urban planning from Middle Tennessee State University.

Campbell is a member of APA, ULI, and the National Forum for Black Public Administrators. She serves on the board of directors of Charlotte Center City Partners, Center for Real Estate at the University of North Carolina - Charlotte, Charlotte Mecklenburg Community Foundation for the Carolina’s, Catawba Lands Conservancy, and the Metropolitan YMCA of Greater Charlotte. She is a graduate of Leadership Charlotte.

Chamelle Hicks

Charnelle Hicks is president of CHPlanning Ltd., a firm specializing in land use, environmental, community, and airport planning. CHPlanning, headquartered in Center City Philadelphia, with offices in Pittsburgh, southern New Jersey, and New Orleans, prepares land use, socioeconomic, and environmental justice analyses throughout the nation. Ongoing projects include neighborhood recovery planning for New Orleans following Hurricane Katrina and PennDOT’s model zoning ordinances in Pennsylvania.

Hicks’s experience includes preparing comprehensive plans and zoning and subdivision regulations for urban and rural communities in both the United States and abroad. CHPlanning also specializes in a wide array of technical services for aviation facilities, which currently include Atlantic City International Airport, Philadelphia Airport,
In 2003 and 2004, at the request of Mayor Anthony Williams of Washington, D.C., and with confirmation by the White House, Noteware led the real estate investment, development, and operations of the National Capital Revitalization Corporation, a joint venture between the District and federal governments to maximize and realize the value of the real estate held by both entities in the nation’s capital.

From 1993 to 2002, Noteware served as chairman and CEO of Maxxam Property Company, the real estate development and investment operating subsidiaries of Maxxam Inc., a Houston-based Fortune 500 Company. Prior to joining Maxxam, Noteware was national director of real estate for Price Waterhouse, leading the firm’s real estate practice nationally and internationally from its New York headquarters. Early in his career, Noteware practiced architecture in California.

Noteware holds a bachelor’s degree in civil engineering and architecture from Stanford University and an MBA in finance from the Wharton School at the University of Pennsylvania.

Richard Ward

Richard Ward is vice president and a member of the Development Management Group of Zimmer Real Estate Services with offices in St. Louis and Kansas City. His principal areas of focus include shaping and advising public/private ventures and partnerships; developer selection and development agreements; site selection and acquisition strategies; incentive agreements between local governments and private investors; and master developer arrangements for complex multideveloper projects.

Ward is a seasoned development adviser and counselor. Prior to joining Zimmer, he was the founder and CEO of Development Strategies, a highly respected provider of professional services in support of economic, community, and real estate development nationwide. Between 1973 and 1986, he was managing partner of two real estate investment partnerships active in inner-city neighborhoods of St. Louis. He is a certified economic developer, real estate counselor, and urban planner and a licensed real estate broker in Missouri.
Ward’s past assignments have been throughout the United States, including development planning and implementation strategies for CORTEX, St. Louis’s urban research park; Knoxville’s South Waterfront District; and Canal Street in New Orleans. In addition, he has prepared economic development strategic plans for various communities and public/private partnerships.

He is also frequently retained as an adviser and expert witness in legal proceedings. These typically relate to questions of highest and best use of real estate and issues associated with land use controls, use of the eminent domain in redevelopment, real estate development best practices, and public/private partnerships.

Ward has served on 11 ULI advisory panels throughout the United States and Europe and is a contributor to a variety of professional journals. He received his MBA from the Olin School of business at Washington University in St. Louis, as well as a master of urban design from Washington University and a master of urban and regional planning from Virginia Tech University.